

**REPORT SUBMITTED BY  
THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN**

**as part of the application for  
membership of the Bologna Process**

**PART I**

Country	Republic of Kazakhstan
Date	4 February 2010
Contact person (one name only) Position	Shaken Turmakhanbetova Head of the Educational Programs Department; Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Email address	shaken@edu.gov.kz; mesrkbp@mail.ru
Contributors to the report	Botagoz Ryssdauletova

**1. General information on the higher education system**

a) Please give a brief description of policy developments and legislative reforms in higher education in your country

The Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan purposefully works to develop higher and postgraduate education system in accordance with international tendencies. Strategic documents defining priorities of higher and postgraduate education development are:

- The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" of 27 July 2007;
- The State Program of Educational Development in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2005-2010 affirmed by the President's decree of 11 October 2004 #1459;
- Strategic Plan of the Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan until the year 2020;
- National plans of basic measures on realization of President's annual message to the people of Kazakhstan;
- Long-term Program of Education Development till the year 2020.

<http://www.edu.gov.kz>

There have been important changes in the structure and content of education in accordance with the law adopted in 2007. Three-Cycle System of higher and postgraduate education (bachelor-master-PhD) has been legally affirmed. Credit system of education has been introduced. A transfer has been made from education quality control to creation of a system of quality assurance. The National Accreditation Center was founded in 2005. The process has been started to introduce democratic principles of higher educational institutions management through establishing Trustee Councils and introducing corporate management. Alliance of students of Kazakhstan operates in the country since 2003. This agency is actively engaged in all processes of local universities. Kazakhstan seeks to develop further student participation, preferably in cooperation with the European Students' Union. Some of Kazakhstani HEIs are members of the European University Association.

b) Give a short description of the structure of public authorities responsible for higher education, the main agencies/bodies in higher education and their competencies (for example, do higher education institutions report to different ministries?);

Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan is the public authority responsible for the sphere of education and science in the country. The Ministry consists of the Higher and Postgraduate Education Department, Secondary Education Department, Technical and Vocational Education Department, Development Strategy Department, Administrative Department, Law Department, Financial Department, Public Procurements and Information Technical Provision Department, Control Committee in the sphere of Education and Science, Children Rights Protection Committee, Science Committee. The National Testing Center is responsible for National Testing procedure of the graduates of secondary schools. National Academy of Education is conducting research in the sphere of education.

c) Give a short description of the institutional structure (for example, number of public/private universities/other higher education institutions or numbers/percentage of students in public/private sector);

There are 9 national, 32 public, 1 international, 13 military, and 90 private HEIs.

d) To what extent are private and State higher education institutions covered by the same regulations?

Private and state higher educational institutions are practically covered by the same regulations. There are some differences, for example, rector of a public university is appointed by the Ministry. Rector of a private university is appointed by the owners.

e) Does your country have a national quality assurance system? What are the responsibilities of the bodies and institutions involved?

The Republic of Kazakhstan has a national quality assurance system. Its main tool is accreditation of the domestic educational institutions. The national quality assurance system takes into account international standards, providing two types of accreditation: institutional and specialized accreditation. It is based on qualitative criteria and indicators. Nowadays National standards and criteria of the institutional accreditation have been affirmed. In 2009 10 higher educational institutions passed institutional accreditation of the National Accreditation Agency. The Ministry of Education and Science is fully responsible for the quality of education, it develops and approves national standards of education and study programs.

*The answers to the above-listed questions will act as background information to better understand the answers given to the more specific questions below.*

## **2. Partnership**

Please describe the structure which oversees the implementation of the Bologna Process in your country.

Higher and Postgraduate Education Department of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan promotes and coordinates the implementation of the Bologna Process principles in Kazakhstan. Every HEI implements the action lines of the Bologna Process, for example, signs the contracts with foreign universities, takes part in implementing the mobility of students.

- a) Does your country have a national working group for Bologna follow-up <sup>1</sup>
- Yes  No
- b) Does your national Bologna follow-up group include representatives of
- |                                   |                              |                             |
|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Ministry                          | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Rectors' conference               | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Academic staff                    | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Students                          | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Staff trade unions                | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| National Quality Assurance Agency | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Employers                         | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
- Other (please specify) \_\_\_\_\_
- c) Does your country have a Bologna promoters' group<sup>2</sup>
- Yes  No
- d) Does your national Bologna promoters' group include representatives of
- |                                   |                              |                             |
|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Ministry                          | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Rectors' conference               | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Academic staff                    | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Students                          | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Staff trade unions                | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| National Quality Assurance Agency | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Employers                         | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
- Other (please specify) \_\_\_\_\_

*Please add any additional comments if necessary:*

As soon as Kazakhstan has joined the Bologna Process, a national follow-up group would be installed. Similarly, we will attempt to set up a group of Bologna Promoters/Experts.

---

<sup>1</sup> A group that develops policy proposals for implementing the Bologna Process

<sup>2</sup> A group that supports/advises HEIs on implementation of the Bologna Process

## DEGREE SYSTEM

### 3. Stage of implementation of the first and second cycle

a) Please describe the progress made towards introducing the first and second cycles.

Bachelor degree within the experiment was introduced in some universities in the 1994. From 2001 all universities of Kazakhstan started awarding Bachelor degree. Master degree was introduced in 2001. All the Higher Educational Institutions of Kazakhstan implement the first cycle-bachelor degree. 75 Higher Educational Institutions of Kazakhstan implement the second cycle- Masters degree. As a result, approximately 50% of Kazakhstani HEIs are involved into the two-cycle system of higher educational institutions which corresponds to the Bologna principles, except for study programs in medicine, veterinary and military studies. Students are normally required to study 4 years under Bachelor degree programs and 1-2 years under Master degree programs.

b) Please give the percentage of the total number of all<sup>3</sup> students below doctoral level enrolled in the two cycle degree system in 2008/09.

Total number of all students below doctoral level	Number enrolled in the two cycle degree system in 2008/09	% of all students enrolled in the two cycle degree system in 2008/09
Total number - 634 013 Bachelors - 588433 *Diploma specialists-34186 Masters - 11394	Total number – 170260 Bachelors – 158604 *Diploma specialists-5032 Masters - 6624	From total number of students: Bachelors - 93% *Diploma specialists-3% Masters - 4%

\* Students in longer professional studies such as medicine, veterinary, architecture, etc and upon graduation awarded with diploma of professional higher education (Diploma specialists)

After joining the Bologna Process, the number of Masters and Doctoral programs will be increased in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

c) Please add comments which accurately describe the current situation regarding implementation of the two cycle system in your country:

All educational programs are currently carried out in two-cycle system.

### 4. Stage of implementation of the third cycle

Please describe the progress made towards implementing doctoral studies as the third Bologna cycle.

Please include:

- the percentage of doctoral candidates following structured doctoral programmes including both taught courses and independent research
- the normal length of full-time doctoral studies
- other elements<sup>4</sup> apart from independent research that are included in doctoral study programmes

<sup>3</sup> "All" = all students who could be involved in 2-cycle system i.e. NOT those in doctoral programmes and NOT those in short HE programmes. *NB Students of ALL study fields are taken into account*

- the supervisory and assessment procedures for doctoral studies
- information on whether doctoral studies are included in your country's qualifications framework and linked to learning outcomes
- information on whether interdisciplinary training and the development of transferable skills are integrated in doctoral studies
- information on whether credit points are used in measuring workload in doctoral studies.
- Information on the status of the doctoral students (students, early stage researchers, both)

The educational programs of the third cycle (PhD) in the Republic of Kazakhstan were introduced in 2005. The first PhD degree students' intake within the public order made up 100 people. In 2009 the intake within the public order was increased up to 200 students. The total amount of students studying in doctoral programs in 2009/2010 was 622 students. In the Republic of Kazakhstan the percentage of doctoral candidates (PhD) following structured doctoral programs amounts to 2% from the total amount of state order for manpower development. The normal length of full-time doctoral studies is no less than 3 years pursuant to the Law "On Education" of 27 July 2007. Apart from independent research the doctoral study programs include teaching activities, taught courses, and writing scientific papers for conferences. The students are required to sit a complex exam. The PhD students are assessed by the regular and final attestation. After completion of doctoral studies students are normally expected to defend a doctoral thesis. Apart from dissertation advisors to doctoral candidates HEIs appoint foreign professors or researchers with PhD degrees to consult the students under the corresponding program of study and to help them complete the thesis. The doctoral studies are included in qualifications framework of Kazakhstan and linked to learning outcomes. Interdisciplinary training and development of transferable skills are integrated in doctoral studies. Credit points are used in measuring workload in doctoral studies

## 5. Relationship between higher education and research

a) Please describe the main trends in the role of higher education institutions in research in your country.

Research is an important part of university activities. About 20 % of scientific projects are being realized by the HEIs. For the last two years laboratories of new technologies were opened at 15 universities.

b) Please outline any measures to improve co-operation between higher education institutions and other private and public institutions that undertake research. Please include:

- percentage of GDP spent on research – 0,14%
  - from public funds – 0,13%
  - from private funds – 0,01%
- total annual national research expenditure (expressed in national currency) – KZT 24,6 billion
  - from public funds – KZT 21,8 billion
  - from private funds – KZT 2,8 billion
- percentage of research carried out in higher education institutions (in terms of funding) – 20%
- details of the funding mechanisms for doctoral students in your country

---

<sup>4</sup> E.g. taught courses in the chosen discipline, other taught courses, teaching activities (if these are required as part of doctoral studies), etc.

More than 80% of doctoral students are funded by the Government.

c) Is there any tracking system to follow the further career of doctoral graduates?

Yes

No

If Yes, please specify:

## 6. Access<sup>5</sup> and admission to the next cycle

Describe the arrangements for access between the first and second cycles and between the second and third cycles.

### 6.1 Access and admission between the first and second cycles

Please indicate:

a) the percentage of first cycle qualifications that give access to the second cycle

All academic programs provide access to the second cycle.

b) any first cycle qualifications that do not give access to the second cycle (please specify)

Students may enter the second cycle only if they have the first cycle qualifications and pass the entrance exam.

c) any special requirements for access to a second cycle programme in the same field of studies: *please tick whether graduates must:*

sit entrance exam Yes  No  In some cases

complete additional courses Yes  No  In some cases

have work experience Yes  No  In some cases

If the answer to the last point is yes, please specify what type of work experience is required:

The students are normally required to have work experience under the major of study.

d) any further special requirements for access to a second cycle programme in the same field of studies

e) to which students the above special requirements apply (*please tick*):

all students Yes  No

holders of particular first cycle qualifications Yes  No

students of the same field coming from other HEIs Yes  No

f) which of the requirements apply to students coming from other fields of studies (*please tick*):

entrance exam Yes  No  In some cases

<sup>5</sup> Access as defined in the Lisbon Recognition Convention: "Access: the right of qualified candidates to apply and be considered for admission to higher education."

additional courses Yes  No  In some cases   
 work experience Yes  No  In some cases

## 6.2 Access and admission between the second and third cycles

Please indicate:

- a) the percentage of second cycle qualifications that give access to the third cycle

All academic second cycle qualifications grant access to the third cycle.

- b) any second cycle qualifications that do not give access to the third cycle (please specify)

n/a

- c) any measures planned to remove obstacles between cycles

n/a

## 7. Employability of graduates/ cooperation with employers

- a) What measures are being taken to enhance the employability of graduates with bachelor qualifications? Please include the most recent statistical data on the employment status of graduates of all cycles.

If your higher education institutions also provide professional bachelor programmes, please provide employability data for both types of bachelors separately

The higher educational institutions in cooperation with the prospective employers conduct recruitment fairs for graduates with Bachelor qualifications. According to the current statistical data 50% of graduates with Bachelor qualifications have been employed.

- b) To what extent there is a dialogue in your country between higher education institutions and employers on:

- curriculum design, work placements and international experience  
 Significant  Some  A little  None
- accreditation/quality assurance  
 Significant  Some  A little  None
- university governance  
 Significant  Some  A little  None

- c) Are first cycle graduates able to pursue careers in the public service on an equal footing with other graduates?

Yes  No  In some cases

- d) Have you aligned recruitment procedures and career structures in the public service to take account of the Bologna changes?

Yes  No  In some cases

If no, or in some cases only, please explain the current situation:

## 8. Implementation of national qualifications framework

Please answer the questions below. Please add comments which accurately describe the current situation in your country.

a) Has the national qualifications framework been prepared<sup>6</sup>?

Yes  No

**Comment** In 2009 the Republic of Kazakhstan has started developing the National Qualifications Framework.

b) Does the framework or proposed framework include generic descriptors for each cycle based on learning outcomes and competences?

Yes  No

**Comment** The NQF will include generic descriptors for each cycle based on learning outcomes and competences.

c) Does it include ECTS credit ranges for the first and second cycle?

Yes  No

**Comment** The NQF will include ECTS credit ranges for all three cycles.

d) Has the NQF been nationally discussed with all stakeholders?

Yes  No

**Comment** The NQF has been numerously discussed with all stakeholders on a national level.

**If the answer to d) is No, please answer question e):**

e) has a timetable been agreed for consultations with all stakeholders?

Yes  No

**Comment** The timetable for consultations with all stakeholders have been agreed. In 2009 the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan together with the World Bank developed a project on «Modernization of technical and vocational education» within the framework of which the concept of the NQF is to be worked out by 2012.

**If the answer to d) is Yes, please answer the following questions:**

f) Are all formal arrangements/decisions for implementing the framework in place and have the necessary formal decisions for establishing the framework been taken?

Yes  No

**Comment** Within the framework of activities of the interdepartmental work group on development of a concept of the draft Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan «On amendments to some legislative acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan on problems of the technical and vocational education» a legal platform for formation of a single National Qualifications Framework, professional standards, effective system of certification of professional qualifications is to be set up.

<sup>6</sup> A national framework of qualifications compatible with the overarching framework of qualifications of the EHEA

g) How far has the implementation of the national qualifications framework progressed (**please tick one**)

- The framework is fully implemented. All qualifications have been added to the NQF through a QA procedure (e.g. accreditation)
- There is significant progress on implementing the framework
- The work of describing all qualifications in terms of learning outcomes and competencies has been completed
- There is a timetable for implementation and the work has started
- Work on implementing the framework has not yet started but a timetable for implementation has been agreed
- Work on implementing the framework has not yet started and there is no timetable for implementation

**Comment** The NQF has not been fully implemented. However, the Republic of Kazakhstan has made significant progress on implementing the framework. In addition, the work on describing all qualifications in terms of learning outcomes and competences has been completed. We have a schedule for implementation of the NGF and the work has started. The Labour and Social Security Ministry of the Republic of Kazakhstan coordinates development of the professional standards. The projects of professional standards for tourist and oil and gas sectors have been already prepared.

h) What is the stage of progress on the self-certification of compatibility with the EHEA framework ?

Completed       Started, but not yet completed       Not yet started

**Comment** Self-certification is planned once NQF is in place.

i) Has the self-certification report been published?

Yes       No

**Comment**

*Please add any additional comments if necessary:*

**Comment**

## NATIONAL IMPLEMENTATION OF THE STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE IN THE EHEA (ESG)<sup>7</sup>

### 9. Reviewing the QA system against the ESG<sup>8</sup> and national support for implementation

a) Has your national QA system been reviewed against the ESG?

Yes  No   Not yet, but such a review is planned  
(Please specify time) to be conducted  
in 2012

b) If a review has been undertaken or is planned, please give further details of the review process.

ENQA granted the National Accreditation Center of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan Associate status within ENQA. The National Accreditation Center has developed the Standards and criteria of institutional accreditation harmonized with the European standards and guidelines for quality assurance system within the framework of the European Commission's project EUROPEAID/120537/C/SV/KZ «Support the development and monitoring of a Quality Assurance System for Higher Education in Kazakhstan».

c) If a review process has been undertaken, did it result in any of the following:

Stakeholder consultation on changes required to the national QA system?

Yes  No

The introduction of specific financial or other incentives aimed at improving the internal quality assurance processes in institutions?

Yes  No

**If Yes**, please give details of these incentives:

- Other measures

Yes  No

**If Yes**, please outline these measures

d) If incentives and/or other measures have been introduced with the aim of improving the internal quality assurance processes in institutions, has any evidence of the impact of these changes been gathered?

Yes  No

**If Yes**, please give details of how evidence of the impact of the changes was gathered, and of the main outcomes that it demonstrates. The National Accreditation Center gathers evidences of the impact of these changes. Based on this data it compiles the National Rating of higher educational institutions.

<sup>7</sup> <http://www.bologna2009benelux.org/documents/Standards-and-Guidelines-for-QA.pdf>

<sup>8</sup> ESG - Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area

## 9.1. Internal quality assurance in higher education institutions

Describe the internal QA systems in place in your HEIs.

The HEIs of the Republic of Kazakhstan have internal systems of quality management of the educational services rendered by the academic institutions.

Please comment in particular on the following aspects, giving references to relevant websites:

a) How many HEIs have published a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality?

All HEIs  Most HEIs  Some HEIs  No HEIs

b) How many HEIs have arrangements in place for the internal approval, monitoring and periodic review of programmes and awards?

All HEIs  Most HEIs  Some HEIs  No HEIs

Please describe what kind of arrangements are in place

All HEIs in the Republic of Kazakhstan create programs, monitor and check its compatibility with demands of the labour market and amend the programs in accordance with the labour market feedback.

c) How many HEIs have described their programmes in terms of learning outcomes?

All HEIs  Most HEIs  Some HEIs  No HEIs

d) Are student assessments at HEIs designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes (based on published criteria) applied in a consistent way?

All HEIs  Most HEIs  Some HEIs  No HEIs

Please describe how the above is achieved.

Assessment of students' knowledge based on intended learning outcomes is conducted through current, interim and final tests or exams in order to determine how they progress within the educational programs in line with the Rules approved by the decree of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan of 18 March 2008 #125 «On approval of the Rules for conduction of current, interim and final students' attestation».

e) How many HEIs publish up to date, impartial and objective information about the programmes and awards offered?

All HEIs  Most HEIs  Some HEIs  No HEIs

**Additional information if necessary**

## 10. Stage of development of external quality assurance system

Describe the external quality assurance system operating in your country.

Please include:

a) the stage of implementation of your external quality assurance system

The main tool of the external quality assurance system is accreditation of educational organizations. In Kazakhstan the national model of accreditation is created, it takes into account international standards providing for two types of accreditation: institutional and specialized accreditation. It is based on the qualitative criteria and indicators. Nowadays national standards and criteria of institutional accreditation are affirmed. In 2009 10 higher educational organizations passed institutional accreditation of the National Accreditation Agency. In addition, Kazakhstani HEIs pass international accreditation. The institutional accreditation consists of the following stages: self-assessment, preparation of a self-assessment report and external review.

b) does your external quality assurance system operate at a national level;

Yes  No

If **No**, please specify:

c) does your external quality assurance system cover all higher education<sup>9</sup>

Yes  No

If **No**, please specify which types of institutions or programmes are not covered by your external quality assurance system:

d) which of the following elements are included in your external quality assurance system:

- |                          |   |                             |
|--------------------------|---|-----------------------------|
| - self-assessment report | Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| - external review        | Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| - publication of results | Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |
| - follow-up procedures   | Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> |

e) has a peer review of the national agency(ies) according to the Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA already taken place

Yes  No

If **No** is there a date set for the review?  Yes (please specify date to be started in 2013) No

The peer review is expected to be started in 2013.

<sup>9</sup> Higher education: all types of courses of study or sets of courses of study, training or training for research at the post secondary level which are recognised by the relevant authorities as belonging to a country's higher education system.

## 11. Level of student participation

From the following, please indicate all aspects of quality assurance in which students are involved:

- a) in governance of national agencies for QA. Yes  No  In some cases
- b) as full members in external review teams Yes  No  In some cases
- c) as observers in external review teams Yes  No  In some cases
- d) as part of the decision making process for external reviews Yes  No  In some cases
- e) in the consultation process during external reviews (eg arrangements for external reviewers to consult with students) Yes  No  In some cases
- f) in internal quality assurance (e.g. periodic review of programmes) Yes  No  In some cases
- g) in preparation of self-assessment reports. Yes  No  In some cases
- h) in follow-up procedures: Yes  No  In some cases

*Please add any additional comments, especially if students are **not** involved in any of the aspects:*

We intend to increase students' participation in QA according to the European standards.

## 12. Level of international participation

In which of the following is there international participation in quality assurance

- a) the governance of national agencies for quality assurance Yes  No  In some cases
- b) the external evaluation of national quality assurance agencies Yes  No  In some cases
- c) teams for external review of institutions or programmes, either as members or observers Yes  No  In some cases
- d) membership of ENQA Yes  No  In some cases
- e) membership of any other international network Yes  No  If **Yes**, please specify:

ENQA granted the National Accreditation Center of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan Associate status within ENQA. The NAC is the member of INQAAHE

*Please add any additional comments, especially if there is no international involvement in any of the aspects:*

## RECOGNITION OF DEGREES AND STUDY PERIODS

### 13. Stage of implementation of Diploma Supplement

Describe the stage of implementation of the Diploma Supplement in your country. Please include the percentage of all students graduated in 2009 who have received a Diploma Supplement (if less than 100%, please explain)

The Diploma Supplement is to be implemented in the Republic of Kazakhstan starting from 2010. The Diploma Supplement will be issued in three languages Kazakh, Russian and English. Hence, 100% of 2010 graduates of the Kazakhstani HEIs will receive the Diploma Supplement.

a) Is the Diploma Supplement issued to students graduating from:

- 1st cycle programmes Yes  No
- 2nd cycle programmes Yes  No
- 3rd cycle programmes Yes  No
- remaining "old type" programmes Yes  No  Not applicable
- short higher education programmes Yes  No  Not applicable

b) which of the following apply to Diploma Supplements issued in your country:

- issued in a widely spoken European language Yes  No 
  - *please specify the language* Kazakh, Russian, English
- issued free of charge  for a fee
- issued automatically  on request
- corresponds to the EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format
- a national Diploma Supplement is used that is different from the EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format

#### 13.1. Use of Diploma Supplement for recognition of qualifications

Please describe the way in which the Diploma Supplement is used for the recognition of foreign qualifications (or studies). Please comment in particular on the following aspects, giving references to any relevant websites and documents:

a) The Diploma Supplement is used as the reference document when admitting holders of foreign qualifications to the second and third cycles.

Yes  No

**Comment**

b) Holders of foreign qualifications who present a Diploma Supplement in a widely spoken language do not have to provide official translations of their qualifications.

Yes  No

**Comment** Holders of foreign diplomas are obliged to present the official translation of their diplomas together with transcript of records in Russian or Kazakh.

c) Holders of foreign qualifications who present a Diploma Supplement in a widely spoken language do not need to prove through other documents the validity of the qualifications in the awarding country (for further studies or employment in the non-regulated part of the labour market).

Yes  No

**Comment** The National Accreditation Center checks the validity of foreign qualifications. The holders of foreign diplomas are to submit a package of documents: original of the diploma and its Supplement with notarized copies; copies of identity card or passport; information on accreditation of the host HEIs or the academic program.

d) Specific action has been taken at a National and Institutional level to enhance the use of the Diploma Supplement as a communication tool towards the labour market

Yes  No

**Comment**

#### 14. National implementation of the principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention

Describe the stage of implementation of the main principles and later supplementary documents<sup>10</sup> of the Lisbon Recognition Convention.

a) Does appropriate legislation comply with the Lisbon Convention?

Yes  No

**If Yes**, please demonstrate how it is achieved: The Republic of Kazakhstan has ratified the Lisbon Convention of Recognition of Higher Education Qualifications. Current legislation on recognition of foreign qualifications complies with the regulations and principles of the Lisbon Convention.

b) Does appropriate legislation comply with the later Supplementary Documents:

i) Recommendation on the Criteria and Procedures for Recognition

Yes  No

**If Yes**, please demonstrate how it is achieved: Recognition of higher education qualifications is carried out through the procedures held by the National Accreditation Center in accordance with the current legislation.

ii) Recommendation on the Recognition of Joint Degrees

Yes  No

**If Yes**, please demonstrate how it is achieved: In accordance with provisions of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" the Kazakhstani HEIs are entitled to conduct joint programs and issue joint diplomas and degrees. Kazakhstani HEIs are entitled to conclude agreements on cooperation with the foreign universities independently, particularly in the sphere of joint degrees programs.

iii) Code of Good Practice in the Provision of Transnational Education

Yes  No

<sup>10</sup> Recommendation on the Criteria and Procedures for Recognition (2001); Recommendation on the Recognition of Joint Degrees (2004); Code of Good Practice in the Provision of Transnational Education (2001)

If Yes, please demonstrate how it is achieved:

c) which of the following principles are applied in practice

i) applicants' right to fair assessment

Yes  No

If Yes, please describe how it is ensured at national and institutional level All applicants have right to fair assessment according to current legislation.

ii) recognition if no substantial differences can be proven

Yes  No

If Yes, please describe how it is ensured at national and institutional level

lii) demonstration of substantial differences, where recognition is not granted

Yes  No

If Yes, please describe how it is ensured at national and institutional level

iv) provision of information about your country's HE programmes and institutions

Yes  No

If Yes, please describe how it is done in practice The information about Kazakhstani HE system, study programs, national educational standards are published on the site www.edu.gov.kz

v) do you have a fully operational ENIC

Yes  No

If Yes, please describe the role of your ENIC in recognition and information provision a) nationally and b) internationally

d) As additional information, please describe any actions to implement fully the Convention and the later Supplementary Documents.

## 15. Stage of implementation of ECTS<sup>11</sup>

Describe the implementation of ECTS in your country.

a) Please include the percentage of the total number of higher education programmes<sup>12</sup> in which all programme components are linked with ECTS credits

100%  75-99%  50-75%  <50%

All Bachelor and Master programs are estimated in national credits and now we are in process of creating the special transfer procedure of ECTS credits. This procedure will

<sup>11</sup> Please refer to definitions in the ECTS User's guide, [http://ec.europa.eu/education/programmes/socrates/ects/guide\\_en.html](http://ec.europa.eu/education/programmes/socrates/ects/guide_en.html)

<sup>12</sup> Except doctoral studies

be discussed on the meeting of Vice-rectors of all universities on the 15 of February 2010.

b) Are ECTS credits linked with learning outcomes<sup>13</sup> in your country? Please tick one:

No  In some programmes  In the majority of programmes   
In all programmes

c) If you use credit system other than ECTS, please give details of your national credit system:

National credit system in Kazakhstan has some specifics. Credits are allocated to all components of study program and linked with competences, but these competences are still performed. The workload of full-time student is about 32 national credits per academic year or 1440 academic hours. The duration of academic hour is 50 minutes in all HEI's. Credits can only be obtained after successful completion of the course. Credits are linked with contact hours.

i) is it compatible with ECTS? Yes  No

ii) what is the ratio between national and ECTS credits?

d) Are you taking any action to improve understanding of learning outcomes?

Yes  No

**If Yes,** please explain: A national seminar on learning outcomes was organized to spread understanding of it.

e) Are you taking any actions to improve measurement and checking of student workload?

Yes  No

**If Yes,** please explain: In order to foster the implementation of ECTS in Kazakhstan further, legal acts will be developed that ensure that ECTS will be based on learning outcomes and student workload.

f) Are you taking any actions to assist HE staff or other stakeholders in applying ECTS.

Yes  No

**If Yes,** please explain: In 2010 the Ministry plans to arrange a series of seminars for HEI staff. The program includes the essentials of ECTS credits, ECTS key documents, writing learning outcomes, and ECTS grading scale.

<sup>13</sup> Clarification: Learning outcomes in the form of knowledge, skills and competences are formulated for all programme components and credits are awarded only when the stipulated learning outcomes are actually acquired

## LIFELONG LEARNING

### 16. Recognition of prior learning

Describe the measures in place to recognise prior learning (RPL), including non-formal and informal learning (for example learning gained in the workplace or in the community).

a) Do you have nationally established procedures in place to assess RPL as a basis for access to HE programmes?

Yes  No

**If Yes**, please specify: This procedure is still being developed. The Law "On education" provides for additional education.

b) Do you have nationally established RPL procedures in place to allocate credits towards a qualification?

Yes  No

**If Yes**, please specify:

c) Do you have nationally established RPL procedures in place to allocate credits for exemption from some programme requirements?

Yes  No

**If Yes**, please specify:

d) To what extent are any such procedures applied in practice?

Comprehensively  Some  A little  None

Please describe the current situation:

### 17. Flexible learning paths

Describe legislative and other measures taken by your country to create opportunities for flexible learning paths in higher education, to encourage participation by under-represented groups.

In accordance with the Law «On education» the second higher education under short-term courses (programs) is provided.

a) Are there specific measures in place to promote flexible learning paths within the national qualifications framework?

Yes  No

Please add appropriate comments to describe the current situation

b) Are there any measures to support HE staff in establishing flexible learning paths?

Yes  No

Please add appropriate comments to describe the current situation

c) Is there flexibility in entry requirements aimed at widening participation?

Yes  No

Please add comments to describe the current situation and, where appropriate, differences between the three Bologna cycles

d) Are there any flexible delivery methods to meet the needs of diverse groups of learners

Yes  No

Please add comments to describe the current situation and, where appropriate, differences between different Bologna cycle

e) Are there modular structures of programmes to facilitate greater participation?

Yes  No

Please add comments to describe the current situation and, where appropriate, differences between different Bologna cycle

f) If possible, please provide any statistics on the results of measures taken to create opportunities for flexible learning paths in higher education, to encourage participation by under-represented groups,

n/a

## JOINT DEGREES

### 18. Establishment and recognition of joint degrees<sup>14</sup>

a) Describe the legislative position on joint degrees in your country.

Are joint degrees specifically mentioned in legislation?

Yes  No

Does the legislation fully allow:

i) establishing joint programmes?

Yes  No

If No please explain what are the obstacles

ii) awarding joint degrees?

Yes  No

If No please explain what are the obstacles

b) Please give an estimate of the percentage of institutions in your country which are involved in

i) joint degrees

75-100%  50-75%  25-50%  1-25%  0%

ii) joint programmes

75-100%  50-75%  25-50%  1-25%  0%

<sup>14</sup> A *joint degree* is a single degree certificate awarded by two or more institutions, where the single degree certificate is valid without being supplemented by any additional national degree certificate.

c) What is the level of joint degree/ programme cooperation in your country

In the first cycle? None  Little  Widespread

In the second cycle? None  Little  Widespread

In the third cycle? None  Little  Widespread

d) In which subject areas/disciplines is joint degree/programme co-operation most widespread (please list if possible)?

Economics, Engineering, Business, Information and Communication Technologies, etc.

e) Estimate the number of joint programmes in your country

About 37 joint programs.

f) Describe any actions being taken to encourage or allow joint programmes.

The Ministry finances some universities to invite well-known academicians from foreign universities. A national experiment on joint degrees is in process in ten HEIs.

g) Are there any specific support systems for students to encourage joint degree cooperation?

Specific support systems for students are expected to be set up in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

## MOBILITY

### 19. Removing obstacles to student and staff mobility

a) What measures have been taken by your country both at governmental and institutional level to enhance student and staff mobility and overcome main obstacles?

Both at governmental and institutional level student and staff mobility has been affirmed by the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education". Thanks to ECTS student and staff mobility, transfer of students from one HEI to another was simplified. HEIs of Kazakhstan have a vast amount of bilateral agreements on student exchange.

b) Have arrangements for visas, residence and work permits been amended to enhance student and staff mobility?

Yes  No

**Please add** appropriate comments to describe the current situation: HEIs are in charge of all visa, residence and work permits' arrangements.

c) Is there financial support for national and foreign mobile students and staff?

Yes  No

**Please add** appropriate comments to describe the current situation: The Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan allots funds from the national budget in order to invite foreign teachers from Great Britain, the USA, Germany, France, Switzerland, Spain, Hungary, Poland, China, Japan, Korea, Belgium, Austria, Israel, Russia, etc. The Bolashak International Scholarship of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan (initiated in 1993) sponsors about 3000 talented students from Kazakhstan during their

studies in more than 27 countries. The Government allots 200 educational grants for foreign students (Turkic-speaking countries) annually.

d) Are study periods taken abroad recognised?

Yes  No

**Please add** appropriate comments to describe the current situation: The Republic of Kazakhstan recognizes study periods taken abroad. These study periods are considered as the academic achievements of students.

e) Is there accommodation for mobile students and staff?

Yes  No

**Please add** appropriate comments to describe the current situation: The mobile students and staff are provided with accommodation at students' hostels and in rented apartments.

f) Have any measures been taken to increase outward student and staff mobility?

Yes  No

**Please add** appropriate comments to describe the current situation: The staff mobility is increased by providing the teachers of the HEIs with grants on conduction of research, namely internships at foreign educational institutions. The amount of one grant usually accounts for USD 18 000.

## 20. Portability of loans and grants

a) Are portable grants available in your country?

Yes  No

**If No**, describe any measures being taken to increase the portability of grants. The current legislation does not provide portable grants for students. However, the Bolashak Scholarship Scheme is being realized in the Republic of Kazakhstan since 1994. It offers Kazakhstani students a unique chance to do Bachelor, Master or PhD degree overseas at the expense of the republican budget. Some 1700 students have already graduated from the top-ranking foreign universities under the Bolashak Program. 3000 students from Kazakhstan study at highly-reputable overseas universities in more than 27 countries annually thanks to the Bolashak Program.

b) Are portable loans available in your country?

Yes  No

**If No**, describe any measures being taken to increase the portability of loans. The current legislation does not provide for portable loans for students.

## THE ATTRACTIVENESS OF THE EHEA AND COOPERATION WITH OTHER PARTS OF THE WORLD

### 21. Implementation of strategy

a) Describe any measures being taken by your country to implement the strategy "European Higher Education in a Global Setting"

We have not yet taken any measures but we are aiming to become a part of the Bologna Process. Kazakhstan has done a lot in order to increase the Bologna Process in Central Asia

**b) What has your country done to:**

i) improve information on the EHEA outside Europe?

n/a

ii) promote European higher education, enhance its world-wide attractiveness and competitiveness?

n/a

iii) strengthen cooperation based on partnership in higher education?

HEIs of the Republic of Kazakhstan signed a wide range of memorandums for cooperation with the foreign educational institutions. In 2008 more than 50 Memorandums of cooperation on introduction of joint programs were signed with universities of Great Britain, Spain, Germany, Czech Republic, the USA, Canada, Russia, etc. Programs of study of the top-ranking European universities are being implemented by the Kazakhstani HEIs.

iv) intensify policy dialogue with partners from other world regions?

The memorandums for cooperation mentioned above indeed intensify the policy dialogue and cooperation with countries-signatories. They serve as a platform for exchange of ideas and students and staff mobility.

v) improve recognition of qualifications with other world regions?

c) What measures have been taken in your country to implement the *OECD/UNESCO Guidelines for Quality Provision in Cross-border Higher Education*? Please describe.

No measures have been taken yet but we are planning on taking them.

d) Are the *OECD/UNESCO Guidelines for Quality Provision in Cross-border Higher Education* applied to

i) cross-border provision of your education programmes?

Yes  No

**If Yes** please explain in what ways the guidelines are applied

ii) incoming higher education provision?

Yes  No

**If Yes** please explain in what ways the guidelines are applied

## F UTURE CHALLENGES

### 22. Main challenges for higher education

Give an indication of the main challenges ahead for higher education and the Bologna Process in your country in the short and long term.

- Development and implementation of the NQF corresponding to the standards of the EHEA qualifications framework;
- Development of the NQF for lifelong learning;
- Creation of the national ENIC/NARIC center;
- Development of the university study programs compatible with the Bologna Declaration provisions;
- Creation of the up-to-date mechanisms of recognition of prior learning;
- Development of portability of student grants and loans;
- Increasing student and academic staff mobility (visa, residence and work permits procedures);
- Increasing university autonomy;
- Increasing the level of students' participation

## PART II

### TEMPLATE for NATIONAL STRATEGIES on THE SOCIAL DIMENSION of THE BOLOGNA PROCESS

#### Practical instruction

**Please do not exceed the length of 10 pages for the national strategy on social dimension.**

The questions in Annex C are not included in the questionnaire itself but are to be considered as reference material which could facilitate the drafting of the information on the national strategy.

#### I. Definition of the Social Dimension in the London Communiqué

“We strive for the societal goal that the student body entering, participating in and completing higher education should reflect the diversity of our populations. We therefore pledge to take action to widen participation at all levels on the basis of equal opportunity.”

#### II. AS IS SITUATION (Current state of affairs)

1. Which groups in society are still underrepresented in your national higher education system? What are the main obstacles to participative equity in terms of access and successful completion of studies?

Currently all social groups have access to higher education in the Republic of Kazakhstan in line with the Law “On Education” of the Republic of Kazakhstan of 27 July 2007. Socially disadvantaged groups such as disabled and orphans have specific quotas enabling them to enter the national higher educational institutions.

Students are free to choose the academic institutions, either public or private HEIs. They all have equal access to higher education under various educational programs. They may obtain undergraduate degrees in public and private institutions on a competitive basis in accordance with results achieved at the Single National Testing or complex testing.

Amendments may be introduced in terms of portability of grants and loans for students. In addition, heads of the regions award students with additional grants, employers (national companies and other social partners) cover expenses on education of its employees or their children.

2. Please describe what measures your Government is taking to increase the representation of the groups identified in the question above. Please refer to the possible actions listed in the Bologna Working Group report on the Social Dimension and Mobility (see Annexes A and B to this document).

To increase the representation of the groups identified in the question above the Government of Kazakhstan is taking the following measures:

- adopts new governmental decrees providing for academic grants and quotas for all students;
- promotes access of all layers of the society to higher education through introduction of various educational programs at HEIs;
- provides specific quotas and distance learning for disabled;
- is planning to develop portability of loans and grants;

- provides financial assistance and allots full and partial scholarships for orphans, representatives of vulnerable layers of the society;
- annually increases student places.

3. Describe what measures are being taken by the Government to help students complete their studies without obstacles related to their social or economic background. Again, please refer to the possible actions listed in the Bologna Working Group report on the Social Dimension and Mobility (see Annexes A and B to this document). Please indicate whether the measures apply to all students or only to certain levels or types of higher education institutions.

To assist students with completion of their studies without obstacles related to their social or economic background the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan is taking the measures listed below:

- introduction of distance learning for disabled students;
- provision of full and partial scholarships for disadvantaged groups;
- introduction of quotas for disabled students;
- development of admission rules that are transparent, fair and simple;
- improvement of funding system.

4. Does your country have statistical and/or other research evidence at disposal to underpin the identification of underrepresented groups and the main obstacles to participative equity (see Q 1) ? If yes, please specify. Or are regular student survey organised with the aim to provide data concerning the social dimension?

We do not have data but we are planning to gather data on the social situation of students

### **III. PROCESS TOWARDS A MORE INCLUSIVE HIGHER EDUCATION SYSTEM (strategy for the future)**

5. How do you plan to tackle the challenges identified under Q 1 in the near future (2010-2012)?

(a) Which concrete goals do you want to achieve?

Kazakhstan is keen to create the up-to-date mechanisms of recognition of prior learning and develop portability of student grants and loans. By increasing student and academic staff mobility (visa, residence and work permits procedures) we will strengthen cooperation with the foreign educational institutions.

(b) What actions are planned for the different target group identified above to overcome the obstacles in access, participation and completion of studies by students? Please refer to Annex B and to the suggested approach outlined in the 2007 report from the Bologna Process Working Group on the Social Dimension and Mobility (Annex C to this document).

Please see answer to this question in questions 2 and 3.

(c) is there a specific budget for these measures for underrepresented groups ? If yes, please provide details

The Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan allots funds from the republican budget for the education of the underrepresented groups, namely for disabled students, public grants, Bachelor and Master training, etc. 34 000 academic grants are allotted annually for Master degree students training, 1% of which goes to orphans and disabled students.

d) is there a timeline for action? If yes, please provide details.

The State Program of Education Development in 2005-2010 and the State Program of Education Development until 2020 specify the timeline for action.

6. What arrangements are planned for monitoring progress towards more equitable access, participation and success?

First we aim to gather data on the social situation. On the basis of the analysis we intend to take appropriate action.

#### **IV. INFORMATION ON THE NATIONAL RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE PREPARATION, IMPLEMENTATION AND EVALUATION OF THE NATIONAL STRATEGIES**

Please indicate which authority or other actor is responsible for the preparation, implementation and evaluation of the national strategy and describe the way in which the various stakeholders are involved. Did your country designate (a) contact point(s) for the national strategy? If so, please add the coordinates of the national contact point(s).

The Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Higher and Postgraduate Education Department and the Development Strategy Department are fully responsible for preparation, implementation and evaluation of the national education strategy.

## **ANNEX A**

### **Actions mentioned by the Bologna countries in the 2007 national reports**

#### Financial

- scholarships - means tested
- scholarships - merit based
- research grants
- grants for studying abroad
- grants or loans for (nearly) every student
- unspecified social support system
- free education (at least 1st cycle)
- reimbursement of tuition fees for certain groups
- financial assistance for certain groups/areas
- improved funding systems

#### Structural

- new /expanded routes of access
- broader teaching or learning strategies
- information and preparation at secondary schools
- increase student places
- indirect aid schemes (tax relief, family allowance)
- subsidised residences/meals/transport/books
- provision of student welfare services (health care, day care centres)
- counselling/guidance services

#### Certain groups

- measures for ethnic minorities (not financial)
- measures for disabled (not financial)
- measures for disadvantaged groups (not financial)
- allocation of study places to certain groups
- promote access from all national areas

#### Policy and practice

- explicit widening access policy (devoted funds/units/laws)
- carry out surveys (study & work, disabled students,...)
- evaluations/research of policies and practices
- monitoring access (and retention) by students

## **ANNEX B**

### **Possible actions and tools identified by the 2007 Bologna Working Group on the Social Dimension and Mobility**

Measures to promote equal opportunities for access, participation and completion

- Anti-discrimination legislation covering higher education
- Admission rules that are simple, fair and transparent

Measures to widen access to and participation in higher education

- Outreach programs for underrepresented groups as defined nationally
- Flexible delivery of higher education
- Flexible learning paths into and within higher education
- Transparency of qualifications and recognition of prior learning
- Incentives for higher education institutions to take action to widen access and participation

Study environment that enhances the quality of the student experience

A, Provision of academic services

- Guidance (academic and careers) and tutoring
- Retention measures (modification of curricula, flexibility of delivery, tracking academic success etc.)
- Working tools and environment (well functioning libraries, lecture halls and seminar rooms, internet access, access to scientific data bases etc.)

B, Provision of social services

- Counselling
- Targeted support for students with special needs and students with children
- Appropriate housing conditions for all students
- Provision of healthcare
- Provision of transportation, student canteens etc.

Student participation in the governance and organisation of higher education

- Legislation or other measures to ensure student participation in higher education governance
- Provisions for the existence of and exercise of influence by student organisations
- Student evaluations of courses, programmes and institutions, including action plans and follow-up of actions taken

Finances in order to start and complete studies

- Financial and legal advice for students
- Appropriate and coordinated national financial support systems that are transparent
- Targeted support for disadvantaged groups as defined nationally
- Support measures for students with children

## **ANNEX C**

### **Suggested approach of the work on national strategies on the social dimension**

In time for the next ministerial meeting in 2009 the Working Group suggests that the countries should report to the BFUG on their national strategies for the social dimension, including action plans and measures to show their impact. All stakeholders concerned should actively participate in and support this work at the national level.

The development of a strategy should be followed by a national action plan that includes monitoring mechanisms. Ideally, the strategy and action plan will be based on a national debate on the social dimension and the future priorities of that country depending on the current situation. In order to facilitate a national debate on the social dimension the Working Group proposes the following structure and topics for such a debate:

- Measures to promote equal opportunities

What obstacles are there to equal opportunities within higher education? What protection is there if a student is discriminated when applying for, being admitted to or carrying out studies? Is there a framework for appeal? What action would be the most effective to achieve equal opportunities in higher education?

- Measures to widen access to and participation in higher education for underrepresented groups (gender, ethnic origin, immigration, socio-economic status and background, disability, geography etc.)

What groups are under represented in your national higher education system today? Is there data to show access to higher education by gender, socio-economic background, disabilities, prior immigration, region etc? What obstacles to widened access and participation are there within your higher education system? At other education levels? What actions would be appropriate for the different groups to achieve widened access? Are targeted outreach activities needed?

- Study environment that enhances the quality of the student experience

A, Provision of academic services

B, Provision of social services

What kind of academic or career guidance is provided for the students in your country? What is the student – staff ratio? Are there retention measures adapted to different groups or individuals with different needs? Is the academic success of student tracked? What would be/has proven to be the most efficient retention measures? What kind of study environment is there at the higher education institutions? Do student have access to information, electronically or by other means? What is the condition of libraries, lecture halls and seminar rooms? How do students in your country live? Is housing available, of acceptable standard and affordable? Is targeted support provided or needed for specific student groups? Is counselling available if students run in to personal difficulties?

- Measures to increase formal and actual student influence on and participation in higher education governance and other higher education issues

Are there formal provisions for student influence and participation at all governance levels, in consultative as well as decision-making bodies? Are there formal provisions for student evaluation of the education? Are the formal regulations followed-up with actual practices? Are there informal ways of student influence and participation as well? Do students have an influence on all issues related to higher education? Are students aware of their rights? Do students have organisations that can organise elections to fill elective posts? Is it possible to find enough candidates to fill the posts available? If not – how could this be improved?

- Finances in order to start and complete studies

What kind of information and guidance is provided for students regarding financial issues? How does the average student make his or her living during studies? What kind of state support is provided? Is it appropriate for all groups and individuals? Do certain groups run the risk of being excluded from, or not able to finish their studies, due to financial reasons? Which are these groups or individuals? What could be done to help them? Are students informed about possible employment possibilities after finishing their studies? How is the labour-market relevance of the studies secured? Are former graduates tracked to follow-up their employment rates?

- Monitoring: The participating countries should establish national measures to monitor and evaluate the impact of the national strategy and action plan.

What monitoring mechanisms would be the most appropriate? How could success in strengthening the social dimension be measured short-term and long-term? What quantitative and qualitative data are needed? How is the responsibility for monitoring and evaluation allocated and divided? Are there student surveys carried out to measure the impact of a social dimension strategy? How can student surveys be used in this work?

- Stakeholder involvement

Which stakeholders should be involved in the development of a strategy and an action plan? What should be the responsibility of the different stakeholders when carrying out the agreed strategy and plan?