



MINISTERUL EDUCAȚIEI NAȚIONALE



Republic of North Macedonia

Ministry of Education and Science



ENQA report to the BFUG, 4-5 April 2019, Bucharest

Highlights of ENQA's activities since September 2018

1. ENQA Board and Membership

The ENQA 2018 General Assembly meeting took place on 18-19 October in Astana, Kazakhstan. On this occasion, the Assembly elected five Board members: three for ordinary three-year terms, and two to replace positions that became vacant in the course of summer 2018. Christina Rozsnyai (HAC, Hungary) and Anne Flierman (NVAO, the Netherlands) were both re-elected for their second full three-year terms along with Øystein Lund (NOKUT, Norway) who was selected for his first full term of three years. Daniela Cristina Ghitulica (ARACIS, Romania) was voted for an initial two-year term and Stefan Handke (ACQUIN, Germany) for an initial one-year term. Caty Duykaerts (AEQES, Belgium) and Eva Ferreira García (Unibasq, Spain) were elected as Vice Presidents, and Anne Flierman was reappointed as Treasurer.

The General Assembly endorsed the Board's earlier decisions to grant membership to the Academic Information Centre (AIC, Latvia), the European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education (EAEVE, Austria), and the Netherlands Quality Agency (NQA, the Netherlands). The reports and other materials relating to the reviews are available on the Review Reports and Decisions page of the ENQA website. Currently, ENQA has 54 members (verified against the ESG) in 30 countries of the EHEA, as well as 55 affiliates. In total ENQA represents 45 countries of the EHEA.

2. Key outcomes of ENQA projects

Quality Assurance in Africa – publication of the African Standards and Guidelines (ASG)

Between 2015 and 2018, ENQA has been partnering in the HAQAA Initiative, an initiative between the European Union and African Union Commission, for the harmonisation of quality assurance of higher education across the continent of Africa. The HAQAA Initiative has supported many of the

commitments made within the African Union's Pan-African Quality Assurance and Accreditation Framework (PAQAF).

In the Initiative, ENQA coordinated the drafting of the **Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance (ASG-QA)**, which provides an overarching framework for quality assurance in higher education. The work was carried out by a Technical Working Group consisting of African higher education and quality assurance experts and an expert representing the EHEA. The work was inspired by the existing standards in Africa and in other parts of the world, as well as by the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG).

As a result of an extensive consultation of higher education institutions, quality assurance agencies, ministries, regional bodies and student representatives, the ASG-QA were launched in 2018 in the four languages of the African Union; French, English, Arabic and Portuguese. The ASG-QA consist of three parts; internal quality assurance of higher education institutions, external quality assurance carried out in institutions and the quality assurance of QA agencies. They aim at promoting trust between higher education institutions, quality assurance agencies, regulatory bodies and other stakeholders - for transparency, accountability and increased international competitiveness of African higher education. The standards are expected to be endorsed by the Heads of State in the African Union during 2019.

ENQA was also closely involved in the preparation of a review methodology for the external review of quality assurance agencies, to further stabilise and formalise the external assessment of quality assurance agencies. The review methodology was prepared benchmarking the ENQA Agency Review model as well as the review methodology developed in the SHARE Programme carried out in the ASEAN region.

ENQA working group published “Considerations for QA of e-learning provision”

ENQA published in June 2018 an occasional paper **“Considerations for QA of e-learning provision”** which resulted from the work of an ENQA working group on QA and elearning (2015-2018). The group looked into how elearning is being addressed by external quality assurance, what current good practice could be identified, and how the ESG can be used to appropriately address quality assurance of elearning from the internal and external quality assurance point of view. The resulting **key considerations** are not prescriptive, and thus do not form a parallel set of standards, but are rather intended to help agencies and institutions to reflect on what specificities need to be taken into account when evaluating and measuring quality of elearning, in line with the ESG. The document covers all ESG Part 1 standards and evaluates how their requirements can be met by programmes and institutions. ENQA consulted a wide range of stakeholders, including the E4 organisations, during the drafting of the paper.

ENQA encourages countries, agencies and institutions to use the paper as referenc when devising their specific policies and QA measures for elearning provision. The paper is available on the ENQA website: <https://enqa.eu/indirne/Considerations%20for%20QA%20of%20e-learning%20provision.pdf>

Recent ENQA report on QA and work-based learning (WEXHE project)

ENQA is a partner in the Erasmus+ funded Knowledge Alliance project [Integrating Entrepreneurship and Work Experience into Higher Education \(WEXHE\)](#) which aims to support the development of work-based learning (WBL) relating to HE – internships/work placements, apprenticeships and entrepreneurship – thereby enhancing the value of higher education and supporting the transition of graduates into employment and career success.

In the framework of the project, **ENQA has produced a report which explores WBL with a particular focus on quality assurance:** for instance, where WBL is concerned, which quality assurance criteria are used, and how are they applied and tested. The study includes an analysis of key, publicly available documents and a survey to QA agencies which aimed to identify the role external QA agencies are playing, if any, in terms of guiding and assessing the integration of WBL into educational programs of HEIs in Europe.

The report shows that **there is no European-wide approach followed by QA agencies when it comes to WBL in HE:** some QA agencies have a hands-on procedure, while others see their role as one which verifies that the IQA processes at HEIs alone are sufficient, and still others do not see it as within their mandate or deserving of special consideration at all. The literature review also showed that the attention given to WBL within HE is underdeveloped, with attention significantly skewed to the VET sector.

The report is available on the WEXHE website: <https://wexhe.eu/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/ENQA-report-on-QA-in-WBL.pdf>.

SHEILA-project building a policy development framework on use of learning analytics in HE

After a fruitful collaboration between the different partners, the Erasmus+ project [“Supporting Higher Education to Incorporate Learning Analytics” \(SHEILA\)](#), in which ENQA was involved, concluded in September 2018 with a number of relevant outputs. The project aimed to build a policy development framework that supports systematic, sustainable, and responsible adoption of learning analytics (LA) at institutional level. In the first stages, the project investigated the current state of LA adoption in Europe, drivers for adoption, challenges, and successes.

The SHEILA project observed that the current state of adoption of learning analytics among higher education institutions (HEIs) in Europe was still in its early stages with few having a defined strategy or monitoring framework. However, several HEIs indicated an observation of short-term victories, such as experience-gain, cultural change, infrastructural upgrade, and a better understanding of legal and ethical implications since they started exploring learning analytics.

Several outputs resulted from the project, including, among others:

- [SHEILA research report](#): A comprehensive report on activities performed during the project’s duration and the results emanating from those;
- [SHEILA recommendations for policy development in the field of learning analytics](#): A set of recommendations addressed to HEIs and policy-makers to overcome the main challenges identified during the project development;

- [SHEILA policy framework](#): The SHEILA framework was developed based on data collected from a series of consultations with different stakeholders, including LA researchers, institutional leaders, teaching staff, and students, using interviews, focus groups, and group concept mapping methods. It can be used to support strategy and policy formation in addition to readiness assessment;
- [SHEILA MOOC](#): The use of the SHEILA framework and how it was developed are showcased in a MOOC developed by the SHEILA project team. The three-week course also gives an overview of learning analytics in higher education.

An innovative system for trust-based e-assessment set up by the TeSLA project

ENQA is involved in the Horizon 2020 project [“An Adaptive Trust-based e-assessment System for Learning” \(TeSLA\)](#) which aims to develop a **system that facilitates online examination** in such a way that it **guarantees learners’ authentication and authorship**.

The consortium is composed of 18 partners: 8 universities, 3 quality assurance organisations, 4 research centers and 3 companies. After three years developing, recently more **than 23,000 students and 500 teachers from 7 different universities** have tested the TeSLA system. Pilots covered elements like **communication protocols, educational and e-assessment frameworks, data privacy mechanisms**, and the TeSLA instruments such as **voice, face or keystroke recognition** already integrated in the universities virtual learning environments (VLEs).

In the context of this project, ENQA, together with other QA organisations, is finalising a **framework for QA of e-assessment**. This framework, which will be published in the spring 2019, includes **standards and indicators for the QA of e-assessment**, which have been piloted in the 7 partner institutions. The project will be concluded in spring 2019.

3. External review of ENQA’s agency review process

ENQA has carried out reviews of its member agencies and agencies applying for registration in EQAR systematically since 2011, and since 2015 with a revised review methodology. ENQA’s reviews are geared towards assessing a quality assurance agency’s compliance with the ESG. In spring 2018 ENQA’s members decided that ENQA Agency Review process should also undergo, in its turn, an external evaluation to assess the system’s compliance with the ESG and its fitness for purpose in supporting agencies in enhancing the quality of their work. ENQA commences this process in autumn 2018 when an independent stakeholders steering committee selected the Nordic Institute for Studies in Innovation, Research and Education (NIFU) – after an open call for tender - to be the coordinator of the review of ENQA. The preparation of the self-assessment report by ENQA is undergoing and the site visit is scheduled to take place in September. The review report will be published in early 2020.

4. Upcoming events

ENQA's Members' Forum will take place on 25-26 April in Tallinn, Estonia. The event will focus on the development of ENQA's strategic plan 2021-2026, and will also collect feedback from the QA agencies on what they expect from the Bologna Process beyond 2020 and how they see their role in it.

ENQA's General Assembly meeting will take place on 17-18 October in Yerevan, Armenia. In addition to statutory business, including Board elections, the event will be used to share good practice among European QA agencies.